A Multilevel analysis of the impact of the democratic school climate on the social trust and the intention of future political participation: Preliminary analysis

Seoul National University
Department of Social Studies Education
Hyeyoung Yoo (hyeyoung6530@gmail.com)
Introduction

- A good democratic citizen is the person that not only understand the democratic knowledge and principles but also take an active part in their communities.
Introduction

- Schools are the institutions where students can learn democracy
- Students can experience democratic community as well as learn their political knowledge in the democratic school climate
Introduction

- Students can experience democratic community as well as learn their political knowledge in the democratic school climate
Introduction

• School should give their member the chance to develop their whole personality through interaction their members. It could help to form positive attitude and behaviors (Lee&Mo, 2012)
Research Question

• How school culture can encourage their student’s trust and political participation?
• School Culture and Climate

• “The system of basic assumptions, norms and values, as well as the cultural artefacts, which are shared by school members and influence their functioning at school (Maslowsk, Witziers & Steen, 2005, p.9)”

• School culture could be defined by school members who compose the school, that is to say, principles, teachers, students, and parents of students

• In other words, “daily and substantial experience” of school members affect school culture(Lee, 2002, p.25)
Literature Review

- **School Culture and Climate**

- In Deal & Peterson’s research (1999), they emphasized that positive and cooperative school culture could perform some functions as follow:
  - fosters school effectiveness and productivity
  - improves collegiality, communication, and problem solving
  - promotes innovation and improvement
  - builds commitment and motivation
  - amplifies the energy, vitality, and trust of school staff members, students, and community
  - focuses attention on what is important and valued

- **Culture affects all aspects of a school!!** ➔ It can influences the development of students’ belief and values as well as academic achievement (Deal & Kennedy, 1985; Flynn, M., 1993; Mitchell, J. T. & Willower, D. J., 1992; Mok, M. & Flynn, M. 1997)
Literature Review

• School Culture and Climate

• In Ehamn(1980)’s research

- Formal (civic) education, that is to say, manifest curriculum is related to improve one’s political knowledge, however, one’s affective attitude is influenced by latent curriculum, in other words, school climate or culture
- In this point of view, democratic school culture could offer the exceptional field that student can experience and practice democracy
Literature Review

• Trust

• Trust is essential to make democracy work (Almond & Verba, 1963; Putnam, 2000)
• People who trust others are more likely to participate in public life (Putnam, 2000)

Trust in People
- People who they knows well
- Strangers

Trust in Institutions
- Political communities
- System
- Organization
- Procedures
- Role

(Ryu&Cha, 2014, p.177)
Literature Review

• Intention of Political Participation

Young people can develop their sense of community and trust in the school setting that provide them with opportunities to have experience in democratic procedures.

According to previous studies, people who have the feeling of solidarity and trust in other people and institutions are more likely to participate in their community or political life.

Electoral Participation  Non-Electoral Participation
Hypotheses

- H1: Democratic school climate will have positive effect on the social trust
- H2: Democratic school climate will have positive effect on the intention of future political participation
Data and Method

• ICCS (International Civic and Citizenship Education Study) 2009
  - From IEA (International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement)
  - Survey on the civic attitudes of more than 100,000 14-year old students in 38 countries

• Civil Liberties & Political Rights 2009
  - From Freedom House Index
  - 1 representing the most free and 7 the least free (reverse coding)

• GDP per Capita 2009 (current US dollars)
  - From the World Bank
Data and Method

- Multi-level Analysis
  (3 level random intercept model)

Country Level

School Level

Individual Level

Nested 3-level data structure
Variables

- Dependent variables: **Social Trust**
  - Students’ trust in civic institutions and people
    - Government Institutions (national government, local government, political parties, national parliament)
    - Social Institutions (the police, the media, armed forces, schools)
    - People in general

- How much do you trust each of the following groups or institutions?
  - Not at all / A little / Quite a lot / Completely
Variables

- **Dependent variables**: The intention of future political participation
  
  - Students’ expected participation in future
    
    - Electoral participation: students’ expected electoral participation in future
      - vote in local elections
      - vote in national elections
      - get information about candidates before voting in an election

  - When you are adult, what do you think you will do?
    - I will certainly not do this / I will probably not do this / I will probably do this / I will certainly do this
Variables

• Dependent variables: The intention of future political participation
  - Students’ expected participation in future
    • Non-electoral participation: students’ expected non-electoral participation in future
      - vote in local elections
      - vote in national elections
      - get information about candidates before voting in an election
  • Would you take part in any of the following forms of protest in the future?
    - I would certainly not do this / I would probably not to this / I would probably do this / I would certainly do this
Variables

- Independent variables: **Democratic School Climate**
  - Students’ perceptions of openness in classroom discussions
    - Teachers encourage students to make up their own minds
    - Teachers encourage students to express their opinion
    - Students bring up current political events for discussion in class
    - Students express opinions in class even when their opinions are different from most of the other students
    - Teachers encourage students to discuss the issues with people having different opinion
    - Teachers present several sides of the issues when explaining them in class
Variables

- Independent variables: Democratic School Climate
  - Students’ perceptions of influence on decisions about school
    - Classroom rules
    - School rules
Variables

- Independent variables: Democratic School Climate
  - Students’ perceptions of student-teacher relations at school
    - Most of my teachers treat me fairly
    - Students get along well with most teachers
    - Most teachers are interested in students’ well-being
    - Most of my teachers really listen to what I have to say
    - If I need extra help, I will receive it from my teachers
Result

ELECTORAL / NON-ELECTORAL (LEGAL) PARTICIPATION

Electoral   Non-electoral
### Result

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Control Variables (Individual-level)</th>
<th>Social Trust Model</th>
<th>Political Participation Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Government Institutions</td>
<td>Social Institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b</td>
<td>SE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender (Female=1)</td>
<td>-0.166</td>
<td>0.016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expected Years of Future Education</td>
<td>-0.071</td>
<td>0.008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal Political Efficacy</td>
<td>0.032</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political Interest</td>
<td>0.161</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion of Political Issues outside school</td>
<td>-0.047</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic Participation in the Community</td>
<td>0.042</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic Participation at School</td>
<td>-0.013</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support for Democratic Value</td>
<td>-0.032</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students’ Perceptions of the value of Participation at School</td>
<td>0.051</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Trust</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust in Government Institutions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust in Social Institutions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust in People</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Students’ Perception of Democratic School Climate</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Openness in Classroom Discussion</td>
<td>0.010</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Influence on Decisions about School</td>
<td>0.097</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student-Teacher Relationships</td>
<td>0.209</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

***<0.001  ** <.01  *<.05
## Result

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LEVEL 2</th>
<th>School Mean of Democratic School Climate</th>
<th>Social Trust Model</th>
<th>Political Participation Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Openness in Classroom Discussion(SM)</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>SE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Influence on Decisions about School(SM)</td>
<td>0.062</td>
<td>0.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student-Teacher Relationships(SM)</td>
<td>0.049</td>
<td>0.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School-level Variables</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student-Teacher Ratio at School</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LEVEL 3</th>
<th>Country Mean of Democratic School Climate</th>
<th>Social Trust Model</th>
<th>Political Participation Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Openness in Classroom Discussion(CM)</td>
<td>0.112</td>
<td>0.096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Influence on Decisions about School(CM)</td>
<td>0.277</td>
<td>0.315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student-Teacher Relationships(CM)</td>
<td>0.036</td>
<td>0.232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Country-level Variables</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Political Right (Freedom house index)</td>
<td>-0.217</td>
<td>0.227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Civil Liberty (Freedom house index)</td>
<td>0.182</td>
<td>0.258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GDP (*1000000)</td>
<td>0.194</td>
<td>0.057</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

|         | Number of Obs. (Individual)              | 92128 | 91730 | 92710 | 88961 | 88477 |
|         | (School)                                 | 4372  | 4375  | 4375  | 4368  | 4369  |
|         | (Country)                                | 35    | 35    | 35    | 35    | 35    |

|         | Level2 - Intercept                      | 0.1887 | 0.4344 | 0.1922 | 0.4384 | 0.0069 | 0.0830 | 0.1119 | 0.3345 | 0.2655 | 0.5153 |
|         | Level3 - Intercept                      | 0.4704 | 0.6858 | 0.4993 | 0.7066 | 0.0159 | 0.1264 | 0.1358 | 0.3686 | 0.5881 | 0.7669 |
|         | Residual                                 | 5.0029 | 2.2367 | 5.9303 | 2.4352 | 0.5861 | 0.7656 | 3.3968 | 1.8431 | 10.5569 | 3.2491 |

***<.001  ** <.01  *.<.05
Result

- Intra Class Correlation (ICC, %)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Social Trust</th>
<th>Political Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Government Institution</td>
<td>Social Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC Level2</td>
<td>11.64</td>
<td>10.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC Level3</td>
<td>71.37</td>
<td>72.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Result

- Caterpillar Plot with Residuals from political participation Models (Country Level)
Result

- Caterpillar Plot with Residuals form political participation Models (Country Level)
Conclusion

• First, students’ perceptions of democratic school climate have influence on the students’ trust in various social institutions and people.

• However, school level results are different. School mean of openness in classroom discussion has negatively effect on the trust in government institutions and people.
Conclusion

• Second, students who discuss political and social issues in the open climate at school are more likely to participate later on, but students who think that they have more influence about school decisions are less likely to participate in the future.

• Students’ perception of student-teacher relationships has different effect on participation.

• Students who have good feeling about student-teacher relationship are more likely to vote, but they are less likely to participate in the manner of non-electoral participation.

• In the school level, openness in classroom discussion and student-teacher relationship have positively effect on electoral participation, but influence on decisions about school has negatively effect on not only electoral participation but also non-electoral participation.
Conclusion

- Third, there are almost no significant effect of democratic school climate in the country level.

- Only country mean of influence on decisions about school promotes students’ intentions of future electoral political participation.
Discussion

- From the results, we assume that there are some interaction effects.
- Especially, trust is different effect in accordance with different school culture and (or) national context.
- Trust can have different effects on political participation in compliance with different school culture and country context.
- Some of the findings will require further analysis.
Discussion

Model 1. Basic model

School culture(L2) Individual (L1) → Social Trust(L1)
School culture(L2) Individual (L1) → Political Participation(L1)

National / Social Context(L3)

Model 2. Moderate effect model (Interaction effect model)

Trust(L1) → Political Participation(L1)
School Culture(L1) Individual (L1) → Trust(L1)

National / Social Context(L3)

Model 3. Mediation effect model (Path model)

School Culture(L1) Individual (L1) → Trust(L1) → Political Participation(L1)

National / Social Context(L3)
Thank you

hyeyoung6530@gmail.com